

## BAB VI

### KESIMPULAN DAN SARAN

#### 6.1 Kesimpulan

Berdasarkan hasil analisis dalam penelitian ini, dapat diambil kesimpulan sebagai berikut:

1. Hasil penelitian menunjukkan bahwa telah terjadi praktek *fractional reserve banking* baik di perbankan konvensional maupun di perbankan syariah dengan tingkat kedalaman (*severity*) yang berbeda-beda.
  - a. Pada indikator *short-term liability ratio* (SLTR) diketahui bahwa praktek *fractional reserve banking* di perbankan konvensional lebih besar dengan nilai rata-rata 50% jika dibandingkan dengan perbankan syariah yang hanya berkisar 16%.
  - b. Pada indikator Giro Wajib Minimum (GWM) atau *reserve ratio* diketahui bahwa praktek *fractional reserve banking* di perbankan konvensional lebih besar jika dibandingkan dengan perbankan syariah. Hal ini ditunjukkan dengan nilai Indikator Giro Wajib Minimum (GWM) atau *reserve ratio* perbankan konvensional lebih kecil sebesar 16% dari perbankan syariah yang mempunyai besaran nilai 36%. Pada Indikator Giro Wajib Minimum (GWM) atau *reserve ratio*, semakin kecil nilai *reserve ratio*, semakin besar tingkat kedalaman (*severity*) praktek *fractional reserve banking*.

- c. Pada indikator *fiduciary ratio* (FR) diketahui bahwa praktek *fractional reserve banking* di perbankan konvensional lebih besar dengan nilai rata-rata 28% jika dibandingkan dengan perbankan syariah yang hanya berkisar 16%.
2. Dari hasil penelitian dapat diketahui bahwa FRB memberikan tekanan kuat terhadap penurunan kinerja dan kesehatan Bank Umum di Indonesia. Kondisi tersebut mengakibatkan munculnya potensi *mis-matched maturity* di Bank Umum di Indonesia. Kondisi ini disebabkan jumlah kredit yang disalurkan oleh perbankan di Indonesia mengalami ekspansi yang signifikan. Meskipun demikian, pertumbuhan kredit masih dalam keadaan normal dan tidak masuk dalam kategori *excessive redemption*. Hal ini dibuktikan dengan baiknya pengaruh *credit growth* terhadap kinerja perbankan nasional.
3. Dari hasil penelitian dapat diketahui bahwa FRB memberikan tekanan sangat kuat terhadap penurunan kinerja dan kesehatan Bank Umum Syariah di Indonesia. Hal ini dibuktikan kuatnya tekanan semua variabel FRB terhadap kinerja dan risiko likuiditas Bank Umum Syariah. Fakta tersebut mengakibatkan munculnya potensi *mis-matched maturity* dan risiko “*too big to fail*” di Bank Umum Syariah lebih besar jika dibanding dengan Bank Umum Konvensional di Indonesia, karena secara empiris ditemukan bahwa praktek FRB di Bank Konvensional relatif terkendali dan tidak signifikan pengaruhnya terhadap penurunan kinerja dan risiko likuiditas Bank Umum

Konvensional. Sementara jumlah pembiayaan yang disalurkan oleh perbankan syariah di Indonesia mendorong peningkatan kinerja. Kendatipun demikian, pada saat yang sama memberikan tekanan terhadap risiko likuiditas Bank Syariah. Kondisi ini dipengaruhi oleh akad dan produk di Bank Syariah yang lebih variatif dan meningkatkan pembiayaan *long-term financing*, seperti akad musyarakah.

## 6.2 Implikasi Kebijakan

Dari penelitian ini, dapat dihasilkan saran kepada beberapa otoritas terkait sebagai berikut :

1. Bagi Bank Indonesia dan Otoritas Jasa Keuangan (OJK) dalam menyusun standar penilaian kinerja dan kesehatan Bank Umum (konvensional dan syariah), untuk menetapkan indikator *fractional reserve banking* sebagai variabel yang perlu senantiasa dikontrol secara berkala.
2. Bagi Dewan Syariah Nasional untuk mempertimbangkan fatwa terkait fungsi Bank Syariah sebagai *intermediary*, mengingat ketidaksesuaian Bank Syariah dengan fungsi tersebut.
3. Secara yuridis, perlunya meninjau ulang UU. No 21 tahun 2008 tentang Perbankan Syariah. Misalnya pasal 4 ayat 1, pasal 19 ayat 1 poin i, poin k, pasal 20 ayat 1 poin c, g dan h.

4. Secara praktis, perlu kiranya pengambil kebijakan Bank Syariah membangun sistem *fractional reserve free-banking* (sistem yang bebas *fractional*). Hal ini disebabkan oleh produk Bank Syariah yang lebih variatif dan heterogen dan manfaatnya dapat mengurangi transaksi yang tidak memberikan *benefit* terhadap Bank Syariah.

### **6.3 Saran untuk Penelitian Selanjutnya**

Penelitian ini hanya berfokus untuk membutikan praktek *fractional reserve banking* dan dampaknya secara empiris terhadap kinerja dan kesehatan di perbankan nasional. Penelitian ini akan lebih lengkap jika dilanjutkan dengan penelitian yang berfokus pada penerapan teoritis dan praktis, secara khusus penelitian tentang penerapan *agency theory* pada perbankan syariah.

### DAFTAR PUSTAKA

- Al-Jarhi, M. A., (1981), Towards an Islamic Monetary and Financial System: Structure and implementation, Arabic Language Publications Series No. 5, Jeddah: *International Center for Research in Islamic Economics*, King Abdulaziz University.
- Al-Jarhi, M. A., (2004), Remedy For Banking Crises: What Chicago And Islam Have In Common: A Comment, *Islamic Economic Studies*, **2** (11): 1-20
- Andries, A. M., (2010), Theories Regarding Financial Intermediation And Financial Intermediaries – A Survey. *The Annals of The "Ștefan cel Mare" University of Suceava. Fascicle of The Faculty of Economics and Public Administration*, **9** (2).
- Athanasoglou, P. P., Matthaios D. D., & Christos, K. S., (2006), Determinants Of Bank Profitability In The South Eastern European Region, *Working Paper*, No. 47 September
- Baltagi, B. H., (2005), *Econometric Analysis of Panel Data* (third ed.), New York: John Wiley & Sons
- Bagus, P., & David., H., (2010), Fractional Reserve Free Banking: some Quibbles, *The Quarterly Journal of Austrian Economics* **13** (4): 29-55
- Bencivernga V. R., & Smith, B. D., (1992), Deficit, inflation and banking system in developing countries: The optimal degree of financial repression. *Oxford Economic Paper*, **44**: 767-790.
- Benes, J., & Kumhof, M., (2013), "The Chicago Plan Revisited". *IMF Working Paper*.
- Borio, C., & Lowe, P., (2002), Assessing the Risk of Banking Crises, *BIS Quarterly Review*, December, 43–54.
- Borio, C., & Drehmann, M., (2009), Assessing the Risk of Banking Crises – Revisited, *BIS Quarterly Review*, March, 29–46
- Bryant, J., (1980), A Model Of Reserves, Bank Runs, And Deposit Insurance, *Journal of Banking and Finance* **4** (2): 335-344.
- Cavalcanti, R. O., Andrés, E., & Ted, T., (2004), Money Creation And Destruction, and The Returns To Banking, *Working Paper Series No. 394* September

- Claus, I., & Arthur, G., (2003), Asymmetric Information, Financial Intermediation and the Monetary Transmission Mechanism: A Critical Review, New Zealand Treasury, *Working Paper* 03/19, September
- Calomiris, C. W., (1999), Building an incentive-compatible safety net. *Journal of Banking & Finance* **23** (2): 1499-1519
- Chamley, C., Kotlikoff, L. J., & H. Polemarchakis., (2012), “Limited Purpose Banking– Moving from ‘Trust Me’ to Show Me’ Banking”. *American Economic Review: Papers & Proceedings*, **102**(3): 1–10
- Choudhury, M. A., & Mostaque, H., (2005), a paradigm of Islamic money and banking. *International Journal of Social Economics* **32** (3): 203-217
- Choudhury, M. A., (2004), Micro-Money and Real Economic Relationship in the 100 per cent Reserve Requirement Monetary System, International Association for Islamic Economics, *Review of Islamic Economics*, **8** (15): 35-54
- Cochran, J. P., Steven T. C., & Fred R. G., (1999), Credit Creation Or Financial Intermediation?: Fractional-Reserve Banking In A Growing Economy, *The Quarterly Journal of Austrian Economics*, **2** (3): 53–64
- David, O., & J.C Umeh., (2010), The Effect of Exchange rate fluctuations on Nigerian Manufacturing Sector. *African Journal of Business Management* **4** (14): 2994-2998.
- De Soto, J.H., (2006), *Money, Bank Credit, And Economic Cycles*, 518 West Magnolia Avenue Auburn, Alabama: Ludwig von Mises Institute
- De Soto, J.H., (2008), ”Free Banking and Fractional Reserves : A Comment”, *The Quarterly Journal of Austrian Economics*, **1** (3).
- Davies, R., & Glyn D., (1996), *The History of Money From Ancient Time of Present Day*, New York: Oxport University Press.
- Dell’Ariccia, G., (2012), “Policies for Macrofinancial Stability : How to Deal with Credit Booms”, *IMF Staff Discussion Note* No. SDN/12/06.Policies
- Diamond, D. W., (1984), .Financial intermediation and delegated monitoring, *Review of Economic Studies* **51**: 393-414.
- Diamond, D. W., & Dybvig, P. H., (1983), .Bank runs, deposit insurance, and liquidity. *Journal of Political Economy* **91**: 40-49.

- Dixhoorn, C. V., (2013), *Full Reserve Banking : An Analysis Of Four Monetary Reform Plans*. Stainable Finance Lab, Utrecht, The Netherlands
- Diwany, T., (2003), *The problem with Interest*, terj, Jakarta: Akbar Media Eka Sarana.
- Dornbusch, R., (2008), *Makroekonomi*, Jakarta : PT Media Global Eduksi
- Dow, S., Guđrún J., & Alberto M., (2015), A Critique of Full Reserve Banking. *Sheffiel Economics Research Paper Series*. March 2015
- Dyson, B. G., T. Ryan-Collins. J., & R. A. Werner., (2011), *Towards A Twenty : first Century Banking And Monetary System*. Positive Money, NEF and the University of Southampton Submission to the Independent Commission on Banking.
- Ebrahim, M. S., (2008), The Financial Crisis: Comments From Islamic Perspectives, *IIUM Journal of Economics and Management* **16** (2): 111-138
- Enders, W., (2004), *Applied Econometric Time Series*, (second edition), New York: Wiley & Sons.
- Feldkircher, M., (2012), *The Determinants of Vulnerability to the Global Financial Crisis 2008 to 2009: Credit Growth and Other Sources of Risk*, Bank of Finland, BOFIT Institute for Economies in Transition.
- Fischer, I., (1935), *100% Money*, New York: Adelphi
- Fontenla, M., & Fidel G., (2007), Self-fulfilling and Fundamental Banking Crises: A Multinomial Logit Approach, *Economics Bulletin*, **17** (6): 1-11
- Gul, S., & Hassan I., (2011), The Impact of money supply on Inflation in Pakistan, *Interdisciplinary Journal Of Contemporary Research In Business*. **3** (8).
- Gujarati, D. N., & Dawn C.P., (2009), *Basic Econometrics*. McGraw-Hill Irwin
- Hadinoto, S., (2008), *Bank Strategy on Funding and Liability*. Jakarta: PT Elex Media Komputindo
- Hagen, J.V., & Tai-kuang H., (2006), Money Market Pressure and the Determinants of Banking Crises, *Proceeding in March at seminar in BIS and Academia Sinica*

- Hausmann, R., & Gavin, M., (1996). *Securing stability and growth in a shock prone regione*. The policy challenge for Latin America. Inter-American Development Bank.
- Hariyani, I., & Rayendra L. T., (2010), *Restrukturisasi dan Penghapusan Kredit Macet*. Jakarta: PT Elex Media Komputindo.
- Hilbers, P., Otker-Robe, I., Pazarbasioglu, C., & Johnsen, G., (2005), Assessing and Managing Rapid Credit Growth and the Role of Supervisory and Prudential Policies, *IMF Working Paper*, **151**.
- Hosmer, D., & Lemeshow, S., (2000), *Applied Logistic Regression* (Second Edition), New York: John Wiley & Sons, Inc.
- Hülsmann, J.G., (2000), Banks Cannot Create Money, *The Independent Review*, **5** (1): 101-110.
- Hulsmann, J.G., (2008), *The Ethics of Money Production*, Auburn: Mises Institute.
- Jahn, N., & Thomas, K., (2010), *Determinants of Banking System Stability: A Macro-Prudential Analysis*, Münster: Finance Center Münster, University of Münster.
- Kao, C., & Chiang, M.H., (2000), On the Estimation and Inference of a Cointegrated Regression in Panel Data”, *Advances in Econometrics*, **15**: 179-222
- Karim, S. A., (2010), *The Islamic Moral Economy, A Study of Islamic Money and Financial Instruments*, Boca Raton: Brown Walker Press
- Kay, J., (2009), Narrow Banking: The Reform of Banking Regulation, *Centre for the Study of Financial Innovation*.
- Keen, S., (2011), *Debunking Economics: The Naked Emperor Dethroned?* (Revised and Expanded Edition), London: Zed Books
- Keynes, J. M., (2011), A Treatise on Money: *The Pure Theory of Money and The Applied Theory of Money*, Mansfield Centre: Martino Publishing
- King, M., (2012), *Creating Money out of Nothing: The History of an Idea*, dikutip dari <http://www.themeister.co.uk/economics>, di akses 24 Oktober 2013
- Khan, M. S., (1986), Islamic Interest-Free Banking: A Theoretical Analysis, *IMF StaffPapers*, **33** (1):1-27.



- Klein, N., (2013), Non-Performing Loans in CESEE: Determinants and Impact on Macroeconomic Performance, *IMF Working Paper*
- Koutsoyiannis, A., (2003), “Modern Microeconomics” (2nd ed.). London: Macmillan Press Ltd
- Kotlikoff, L. J., (2010), Jimmy Stewart is Dead: Ending the World's Ongoing Financial Plague with Limited Purpose Banking. Hoboken, N.J.: Wiley.
- Krainer, R. E., (2014), *Economic Stability under Alternative Banking Systems: The Case for 100 Percent Reserve Banking*, Madison: University of Wisconsin
- Krugman, P. R., (2005), *Ekonomi Internasional: Teori dan Kebijakan*, Edisi Kedua Jakarta: Raja Grafindo Persada
- Kunt, A. D., & Enrica D., (1998), *The Determinants of Banking Crises in Developing and Developed Countries*, *IMF Staff Papers*, **3** (1): 81-109
- Lata, R. S., (2014), Non-Performing Loan and Its Impact on Profitability of State Owned Commercial Banks in Bangladesh : An Empirical Study. *Proceedings of 11 th Asian Business Research Conference 26- 27 December, 2014, BIAM Foundation, Dhaka, Bangladesh*
- Leon, B., & Sony E., ( 2007), *Manajemn Aktiva Pasiva Bank Devisa*. Jakarta: PT Grasindo
- Levin, A., Lin, C.F., & Chu, C.S.J., (2002), Unit root tests in panel data: asymptotic and finite-sample properties, *Journal of Econometrics*, **108** (1): 1-24
- Levine, (1997), “Financial Development and Economic Growth: Views and Agenda”, *Journal of Economic Literature*, **35**: 688-726
- Louzis, D. P., Angelos T. V., & Vasilios L. M., (2010), Macroeconomic And Bank-Specific Determinants Of Non-Performing Loans In Greece: A Comparative Study Of Mortgage, Business And Consumer Loan Portfolios. *Bank of Greece, Working Paper*
- Madura, J., (2007), *Pengantar Bisnis* . Edisi Empat, Terjemahan, Jakarta: Salemba Empat,.
- Mallett, J., (2013), Analysing the Behaviour of the Textbook Fractional Reserve Banking Model As A Complex Dynamic System, *In Proceedings of the Eighth International Conference on Complex Systems* (1141–1156).

New England: Complex Systems Institute Series on Complexity. Di akses dari <http://necsi.edu/events/iccs2011/papers/60.pdf>

- Margaretha, F., (2007), *Manajemen Keuangan Bagi Industri Jasa*. Jakarta: PT Grasindo
- Margaretha, F., & Marsheilly P. Z., (2013), Faktor-faktor yang Mempengaruhi Kinerja Perbankan Indonesia. *Jurnal Bisnis dan Akuntansi*, **15**(2): 133-141.
- Marx, K., (1991), *Das Capital*, Vol.3. London: Penguin
- McCoskey, S., & Kao, C. (1998), “A residual-based test of the null of cointegration in panel data”, *Econometric Reviews*, **17**(1): 57-84.
- McFadden, D. (1973), Conditional logit analysis of qualitative choice behavior. In P. Zarembka (Ed.), *Frontiers in Econometrics*, **1**: 105–142.
- Mendoza, E. G., & Marco E. T., (2008), An Anatomy of Credit Booms: Evidence from Macro Aggregates and Micro Data, *NBER Working Paper No.* 14049.
- Meera, AKM., & Moussa, L., (2009), Ownership Effects of Fractional Reserve Banking: An Islamic Perspective, *Journal Humanomics*, **25**(2): 101-116
- Meera, AKM., (2004), The Gold Dinar: The Next Component in Islamic Economics, Banking and Finance, International Association for Islamic Economics. *Review of Islamic Economics*, **8**(1): 5-34.
- Michael .C, Amar. R., & Ryland, T., (2014), Money in the modern economy: an Introduction, *Bank of England Quarterly Bulletin* 2014 Q1
- Mishkin, F. S., (2009), *Ekonomi Uang, Perbankan, dan Pasar Keuangan*, Edisi 8. Jakarta: Salemba Empat
- Musse, O.S.H., Abdelghani, E., & Hassanuddeen, A.A., (2015), Fractional Reserve Banking and Price Stability: Evidence from Gulf Cooperation Council (GCC) Countries. *American Journal of Economics and Business Administration*.
- Noholo, S., & Siti, P.H., (2014), *Analisis Tingkat Kesehatan Bank Pada PT. Bank Rakyat Indonesia Tbk yang Terdaftar di Bursa Efek Indonesia*, Fakultas Ekonomi dan Bisnis Universitas Negeri Gorontalo November.

- Nuri, V. Z., (2002), *Fractional Reserve Banking as Economic Parasitism A Scientific, Mathematical, & Historical Expose, Critique, and Manifesto*, at <http://econpapers.repec.org/>
- Pettifor, A., (2006), *The Coming First World Debt Crisis*, Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan
- Pedroni, P., (1999), “Critical values for cointegration tests in heterogeneous panels with multiple regressors”, *Oxford Bulletin of Economics and Statistics*, **61**: 653-670.
- Pedroni, P., (2000), “Fully modified OLS for heterogeneous cointegrated panels”, *Advances in Econometrics*, **15**: 93-130.
- Pedroni, P., (2004), “Panel cointegration: asymptotic and finite sample properties of pooled time series tests with an application to the PPP hypothesis”, *Econometric Theory*, **20**(3): 597-625.
- Pesaran, M. H., Y. Shin & Smith, R. P., (1999), Pooled mean group estimation of dynamic heterogeneous panels. *Journal of the American Statistical Association*, **94**: 621-634.
- Phelan , C., & Char,V. V., ( 2013), *On the Social Usefulness of Fractional Reserve Banking*, University of Minnesota Federal Reserve Bank of Minneapolis, Research Department, November.
- Phillips, P.C.B., & Moon, H. R., (1999), “Linear regression limit theory for nonstationary panel data”, *Econometrica*, **67** (5): 1057-1111.
- Reinhart, C. M., & Kenneth S. R., (2009), *The Aftermath of Financial Crises*, *NBER Working Paper* No. 14656.
- Richard, G. L., (1966), *An Introduction to Positive Economics*, 2nd ed. (London: Weidenfeld and Nicolson.
- Rothbard, M., (1995), Fractional reserve banking, *The Freeman* (October).
- Ruiz, A. U., (2015), Understanding the dichotomy of financial development: credit deepening versus credit excess. *Working Paper BBVA Research*, Madrid
- Ryan-Collins, J., (2011), *Where Does Money Come From?: A Guide to the UK Monetary and Banking System*, London: New Economics Foundation

- Salvatore, D., (1996), *Ekonomi Internasional Edisi Kelima Jilid 1* (Terjemahan). PT. Gelora Aksara Pratama, Jakarta
- Sanches, D. R., (2013), On The Welfare Properties Of Fractional Reserve Banking, *Federal Reserve Bank of Philadelphia*, August.
- Sani, M.D., S. Arfah, A.K.M. Meera., & Aziuddin., (2013), Fractional Reserve Banking and Maqasid al-shariah: An incompatible Practice, *Journal Humanity & Islam*, **3** (1) : 1-8
- Siddiqi, N., (1992), Impact of Islamic Modes of Finance on Monetary Expansion, *Journal of King Abdul Aziz University: Islamic Economics*, **4**: 37-46
- Siddiqi, N., (2007), *Economics of Tawarruq, How Its Mafasid Overwhelm The Masalih*. A position paper to be presented at the Workshop on Tawarruq: A Methodological issue in Sharī'a-Compliant Finance February **1**.
- Singh, G., (2009), Why is 100% Reserve Banking Inefficient?, India: *Centre for International Trade and Development School of International Studies*, Jawaharlal Nehru University, **9** (7) : 1-25
- Surat Edaran Otoritas Jasa Keuangan Nomor 10/Seojk.03/2014 Tentang Penilaian Tingkat Kesehatan Bank Umum Syariah dan Unit Usaha Syariah
- Sutedi, A., (2014), *Aspek Hukum Otoritas Jasa Keuangan*, Jakarta: Penebar Swadaya Grup
- Suteja, J., & Ichan M. S., (2010), Analisis Kinerja Bank Menggunakan Metode CAMELS untuk Mengukur Tingkat Kesehatan Bank Terhadap Pertumbuhan Laba. *Jurnal Riset Bisnis dan Manajemen*, **3** (1)
- Tabachnick, B. G., & Fidell, L. S., (2007), *Using Multivariate Statistics* (5th ed.). Needham Heights, MA: Allyn & Bacon.
- Tchernev, P., (2005), The Nature, Origins, and Role of Money: Broad and Specific Propositions and Their Implications for Policy, *Working Paper* No. **46**: 1-26
- Valeriano F. G., Vicente, F.C., & Rodolfo, M., (2004), Remedy For Banking Crises: What Chicago And Islam Have In Common, *Islamic Economic Studies*. **2** (11): 1-23
- Von, M. L., (1981), *The Theory of Money and Credit*, Indianapolis: Liberty Fund.

- Wald, A., (1943), “Tests of Statistical Hypotheses Concerning Several Parameters When the Number of Observations is Large,” *Transactions of the American Mathematical Society*, **54**: 426–482.
- Wray, L., & Randall, L., (2012). *The modern Money Theory, A Primer on Macroeconomics for Sovereign in Monetary System*, England: Palgrave Macmillan
- Wray, L. R., (2012). Introduction to an Alternative History of Money, Levy Economics Institute of Bard College, *Working Paper 717*: 1-51
- Wray, L. R., (2014), From the State Theory of Money to Modern Money Theory: An Alternative to Economic Orthodoxy, *Working Paper 792*: 1-35